Forum on Western Sydney Airport

Record of Meeting 10 10:00 am – 2:00 pm, Friday 6 December 2019 Board Room Western Sydney Airport Office, Liverpool Chair: Professor Peter Shergold AC

Item	Description	Key Discussion Points	Action Items
1.	Welcome from the Chair and confirmation of agenda	The Chair, Professor Peter Shergold AC, welcomed members to the fourth and final meeting of the Forum on Western Sydney Airport (FOWSA) for 2019, and opened the meeting by formally acknowledging the Traditional Owners of the land on which the meeting was being conducted. Members were thanked for their flexibility and understanding with the late relocation of the meeting from the Western Sydney International Visitor's Experience Centre to the Western Sydney Airport (WSA) Office in Liverpool. It was noted that although the Experience Centre had been evacuated the previous afternoon by the Rural Fire Service (RFS), the safety of the site had now been confirmed. The Chair noted WSA's confirmation that the next meeting could be held at the Experience Centre. The Chair acknowledged apologies received (see Appendix B of this meeting record) and welcomed delegates representing FOWSA members who were unable to attend the meeting. The Chair provided an overview of the Information session and Open meeting held on 7 September 2019, noting the broad attendance of the public, who included Campbelltown locals, residents adjacent to the airport site, general aviators and residents from the wider Western Sydney and Blue Mountains area. He discussed the feedback received from the public who had attended the session, and noted he'd been advised they had found it informative and were glad to have the opportunity to able to share their views with FOWSA members, as well as engaging directly with the Department and other agencies to ask questions and discuss issues of interest.	Action Item 1: Secretariat to arrange for next meeting to be held at WSA's Visitor Experience Centre

		The Chair thanked all FOWSA members who had been able to attend on the	
		day.	
		Meeting 9 records and actions	
		The FOWSA Secretariat prepared a record of Meeting 9, which is	
		available on the Department's website.	
		There were three Action Items arising from the last meeting:	
		 FOWSA Meeting 9, Item 1 (Secretariat to add to the next 	
		meeting agenda a discussion on the aircraft noise report	
		authored by Dr Eric Ancich and Mr Don Carter, along with the	
		Department's response to the report)	
		This Action Item is covered under Item 5 of the agenda	
		FOMCA Masting O Home 2 (March are to review and associate	
		o FOWSA Meeting 9, Item 2 (Members to review and consider	
		the report prepared by Dr Ancich and Mr Carter and related	
		documents prior to the next meeting)	
		Members present confirmed they had read the report.	
		 FOWSA Meeting 9, Item 3 (Questions submitted to FOWSA for 	
		the open general meeting are to be responded to and published	
		on the department's website)	
		This action item has been completed. The Chair noted that	
		14 questions were submitted by 11 people, which was fewer	
		than submitted for the 2018 open meeting.	
		Members discussed how the questions received from the community continue	
		Members discussed how the questions received from the community continue	
		to shape the future agendas for FOWSA, with issues such as bird and bat	
		strike controls and the noise study developed by two members of the public	
		being addressed in this meeting of FOWSA.	
2.	Departmental	The Chair invited Ms Sarah Leeming from the Department to provide an overview	
	Update	of recent departmental activities to progress the Western Sydney Airport project	
		and related initiatives.	
	1		

Ms Leeming began by providing an overview of recent announcements related to the Department, including:

- the Prime Minister's announcement that the Department of Communications and the Arts will merge with the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Cities and Regional Development, in February 2020
- the merge included the Hon Paul Fletcher MP returning to the portfolio; he will continue to have responsibility for the Communications and the Arts.
- Mr Simon Atkinson has been appointed as the new Secretary of the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development and Communications.

Ms Leeming provided an update on the Department's airspace design process, and advised that progression into the Preliminary Design Phase is expected during 2020. She noted that this would mean work on the Environmental Assessment (EA) could be expected to commence on draft airspace designs, and she anticipated that the work would take at least 12 months.

Ms Leeming mentioned that updating population figures for Western Sydney as part of the Environmental Assessment is a major piece of work that would require assistance from state and local governments.

Ms Alison Morgan, Western Sydney City Deal Delivery Office, offered to brief the Department on recent activities undertaken to update NSW population and growth forecasts, noting that the last census didn't take into account the growth stimulated by the airport and the Western Sydney City Deal.

Ms Leeming spoke about the Department's meeting with Brisbane Airport Corporation (BAC) about the community engagement activities undertaken for the new parallel runway, such as the mobile information centre and the online noise tool. Ms Leeming noted the Department would investigate some of these options .

		On environmental matters, Ms Leeming updated members on the progress of the biodiversity offset site at Orchard Hills (one of the biggest program of its type in Australia) and noted that Greening Australia have offered a tour of their seed production site near Hawkesbury. Ms Leeming advised the Western Sydney Unit was working closely with state and local governments on the City Deal Annual Report. She concluded her update by noting that the Western Sydney Land Use and Infrastructure Implementation Plan (LUIIP) is now in its second version as the Western Sydney Aerotropolis Plan, and that this would be discussed in more detail later in the agenda.	
3.	Western Sydney Airport Update	The Chair invited Mr Scott MacKillop, General Manager for Media and Government Relations at Western Sydney Airport, to provide a project update. Mr MacKillop provided members with an update on the progress of WSA's construction activities. He advised members that: • Badgerys Creek Rd has now been realigned 200m east, with the movement of all paving completed; • Initial earthworks are on track and will be complete in early 2020, at which point 1.7 million cubic metres will have been moved; • Initial earthworks are occurring on 6% of the site; however, once the bulk earthworks phase is underway, the majority of the site will be under construction (the footprint of Stage 1); • At 1,780ha, the site is almost twice the area of Kingsford Smith Airport; • The runway will be 3.7km in length, with the current 12 story height difference found across hills on the site to be graded to a 0.2% difference; • Crushed sandstone from tunneling works on Sydney Metro projects is being brought in to serve as the base of the runway. The Chair thanked Mr MacKillop for his presentation and called for any questions. Members queried whether the number of truck movements to the airport site would increase when transitioning from the initial earthworks to the bulk earthworks phase. Mr MacKillop noted that truck movements of spoil from	

Sydney Metro's excavation had increased truck movements, as had the transport of earthmoving equipment to the site for the bulk earthworks phase; however, these movements had been primarily occurring at night and were almost complete.

Mr MacKillop also advised members that the draft Master Plan for the business park to be built on the airport site is almost complete.

Members were informed that international firm Zaha Hadid Architects and Australian firm Cox Architecture were selected to design the terminal precinct. discussed the outcome of the terminal design. The meeting viewed a video of the terminal concept design. Students from Western Sydney University participated in the concept design development.

Members discussed the design of the public plaza and asked what distance passengers would have to walk in the terminal, noting the expansive layout. Mr MacKillop advised no more than 2-3 kilometers would be expected, and noted that assistance would be available if needed by customers.

A FOWSA member asked about whether fast rail could be introduced to the airport in the future. Mr MacKillop noted that, as the rail will be built underground, there would be the ability to expand it in the future, though it would be a decision for the government of the day.

Members offered comments on the video of the terminal design and suggested adding imagery of the rail connections.

Members asked Mr MacKillop about the use of renewable energy and the airport's emissions targets. Mr MacKillop replied that a sustainability plan is currently being developed. He noted that planning is in the early stages as the airport is still seven years away from being operational. It was noted that this allowed time to investigate and implement the best possible plan.

4. Bird and Bat Strike Risk Assessment

The Chair invited Mr Kirk Osbourne from WSA and Mr Philip Shaw from Avisure to present on Bird and Bat strike concerns raised by a member of the community in a submitted question to FOWSA.

Mr Osbourne began by discussing current bird and wildlife works that WSA were undertaking. He advised that:

- the airport has been conducting monthly survey work since 2018 and this would continue:
- considerations as to how a wildlife fence could be incorporated on site are underway;
- current terminal designs are also looking into how to minimise roosting on site;
- WSA is considering options to make further wildlife information and research available online over the next 6-12 months, and whether this could include an interactive 'safeguarding tool' for the community to use;
- they are aware that as the area develops, communication with local authorities will be important to minimise wildlife and bird strikes through landscape design processes on and off the airport site.

The Chair thanked Mr Osbourne and invited Mr Shaw to continue.

Mr Shaw discussed international case studies with members, and shared statistics on current bat and bird strikes in NSW.

Members were advised that:

- in Vancouver, airports have used falcons, lasers and hovercraft to disrupt birds:
- Generally, coastal areas can have bigger bird problems than inland regions;
- Approximately 1,200 aviation-related bird strikes have occurred over the last 10 years and roughly 100 of these have caused damage - which is more than any other wildlife;
- Sydney Airport is the busiest airport in the country, hence it has more bird strikes, with April and May recording the highest strike rate due to migration patterns in the area.

Mr Shaw then discussed the situation at Western Sydney Airport and what activities were occurring. He noted that:

- WSA is in a rural setting that includes dams and will continue to be affected by wildlife with a NSW Government target to increase tree canopy over from the current level to 40 per cent across Greater Sydney.
- There are seven camps of Grey Headed Flying Foxes surrounding the Airport site and the goal is to ensure safety of aircraft, while protecting wildlife where possible.
- WSA is actively looking for solutions. As this is a greenfield airport, bird and bat strikes can be minimised through design and wildlife movements can be monitored and tracked by radar.
- Management plans are being considered to minimise the impact on existing camps.
- Monthly bird and wildlife surveys are being conducted, including seasonal surveys with a particular focus on the Flying-fox camps.
- WSA is considering aviation radar options for implementation prior to and after aircraft operations commence.

Mr Shaw concluded his presentation by noting that the data collected has allowed for informed input into local planning documents, and plans for growth of certain vegetation. This would minimise the risk of future camps being established in unsuitable areas. By the time the airport commences operations, understanding flowering events in the region will allow more accurate prediction of camp movements, which will help mitigate bird and bat strike risk.

The Chair thanked Mr Osbourne and Mr Shaw for their presentations, noting it was excellent to discuss another significant matter raised by members of the community in such detail. FOWSA members discussed the broad opportunities for planning and risk mitigation measures for a greenfield airport, and agreed that while there is still a lot of work to do on the matter before operations commence in 2026, it is wise that this work is highlighted as a key issue and good that WSA already had the work underway.

5. Technical
discussion:
Assessment of
Measured
Aircraft Noise
Levels under the
Existing Flight
Paths of Sydney
Kingsford Smith
Airport Report

The Chair reminded FOWSA members that in late August 2019 (just before the September FOWSA meeting) the Secretariat circulated a copy of a report prepared by Dr Eric Ancich and Mr Don Carter regarding noise levels from Sydney (Kingsford Smith) Airport and implications for the validity of the 2016 WSA EIS.

The report - Report no.9173 - R1- Assessment of measured aircraft noise levels under the existing flight paths of Sydney Kingsford Smith Airport (KSA) with reference to Western Sydney Airport (the Ancich report) has generated much community interest, including interest from FOWSA members.

The Chair invited Dr Rob Bullen from Wilkinson Murray to speak on the issues raised by the Ancich report. Dr Bullen holds a PhD (Acoustics) and is a member of the Australian Acoustical Society and the Australian Standards Committee EV-011 relating to Aircraft & Helicopter Noise. While working with Wilkinson Murray, Dr Rob Bullen was a lead author of the acoustic studies undertaken as part of the WSA 2016 EIS, and has subsequently undertaken many similar assessments for major airport development proposals across Australia. Members were invited to discuss whether they wanted Dr Ancich and Mr Carter to present on the Ancich report at FOWSA at the conclusion of Dr Bullen's presentation.

Dr Bullen began by explaining that the Ancich report is critical of work done in the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS). It compared noise levels from KSA flight paths with noise levels predicted from indicative flight tracks in the 2016 WSA EIS. The report claimed measured levels from Sydney Airport are significantly higher than EIS predictions for similar locations around Western Sydney Airport.

He noted that the Ancich report also criticises the use of LAmax and the Integrated Noise model (INM), as reported in the 2016 WSA EIS, as the authors believe that this does not fully account for variability in aircraft heights on nominated flight paths. The authors have further suggested that this variability in height was not reported in the 2016 WSA EIS.

Claim 1 - Criticism of EIS Measurements

Action Item 2: Secretariat to send members copy of correspondence register between the Department and Dr Ancich/Mr Carter

Dr Bullen advised that the noise level measurements presented in the Ancich report for individual aircraft movements were recordings of the modelled aircraft noise predicted in the 2016 WSA EIS, but reported differently. The individual aircraft movement noise recordings in the Ancich Report were reported using the fast setting on the noise recorder, rather than the slow setting as required in Australian Standard AS 2021.

The difference of using the fast and the slow setting on the noise recorder is a 3 to 5 decibel (dBA) difference, as the average sound in the slow setting is measured over one second rather than an eighth of a second on the fast setting. Dr Bullen explained this accounts for some of the difference in aircraft departures recorded and presented in the 2016 WSA EIS and those presented in the Ancich report.

In regards to the difference in reported decibels for aircraft arrivals into Sydney between the Ancich report and the 2016 WSA EIS, this can be largely explained by the difference in the approach procedure adopted at the two airports. Arrivals into Sydney Airport are generally 'stepped arrivals' as opposed to Continuous Descent Approach (CDA) tracks, which are 5-8 dBA quieter. The 2016 WSA EIS proposed CDA approaches into WSA in order to protect residential amenity. This combined with the 3-5 dBA difference in 'fast' vs 'slow' setting explains discrepancies in the aircraft noise levels presented in the 2016 WSA EIS and the Ancich report.

Claim 2 - Criticism of Prediction Techniques

Dr Bullen then explained how LAmax is measured as the average of maximum noise levels from a specific aircraft type performing a specific operation over a number of flights, rather than a single absolute maximum noise event from a single event – being the 'noisiest possible'.

Mr Bullen said that the Ancich report referred to the single maximum noise level (or noisiest single event), which did not give an accurate picture of what may generally be expected. Dr Bullen emphasised that the EIS shows the average of max noise levels as per the standard (Australian Standard AS 2021) to measure

aircraft noise, and noted that this is established practice in undertaking acoustic assessment of aircraft noise for new flight paths.

The Ancich report claims that the 2016 WSA EIS made no calibration of the Integrated Noise Model (INM), unlike at Brisbane Airport for their new parallel runway. Dr Bullen explained why benchmarking was not undertaken with the INM, as Western Sydney Airport is not yet operational. Dr Bullen explained that local conditions have a significant impact on noise benchmarking, and hence benchmarks undertaken at other airports would not be scientifically reliable if applied to WSA.

Furthermore, Dr Bullen explained that pilots sometimes fly differently on published procedures, and that this can lead to variation from predicted noise levels derived from INM modelling.

The Ancich report also criticised the EIS for having not accounting for the variable height of aircraft arrivals and departures. However, Dr Bullen explained a range of factors may influence noise settings more than height, including topography, meteorology and aircraft thrust and flap settings.

Dr Bullen concluded that in his opinion there is no justification for the criticism regarding 'calibration' of the noise model, or handling of aircraft heights, and he noted that noise models for changes to airspace and flight paths require extensive public consultation to clarify matters such as these.

Members added to the discussion, noting that the perception of seeing an underbelly of an airplane can make it seem louder than it really is.

Cr Paul Rasmussen asked whether the noise abatement procedures had been looked at for Western Sydney Airport. Dr Bullen replied that some were considered on the indicative flight paths shown in the 2016 EIS, such as the Continuous Descent Approaches (CDA).

Ms Jo Bromilow asked if a comparison between WSA and KSA would be useful to show any differences. It was explained that KSA is unique in the way aircraft

		fly in and out, with major variations in height and spread occurring. This type of operational difference doesn't allow for a viable comparison between KSA and any other airport in Australia.	
		Mr Greg Copeland asked whether other airports use CDA and why KSA does not. It was confirmed that other airports in Australia do use CDA. It was noted that the reason KSA cannot is partly due to the technology and partly due to the location of the runway. Members discussed the use of historical tracks being added as KSA grew over the years, different to WSA now having the ability to create an airspace design from 'ground up', which allowed space for noise abatement procedures such as CDA.	
		Members thanked Dr Bullen for his detailed presentation, and noted how important it would be to have this level of information available once draft flight paths for WSA have been developed, to ensure the community was well informed. No members present requested Dr Ancich and Mr Carter be invited to clarify any detail in their submission.	
6.	Western City and Aerotropolis Authority update	The Chair invited Mr Sam Sangster, CEO at Western City & Aerotropolis Authority (WCAA), to present on the WCAA and its key priorities. Mr Sangster opened his presentation by advising FOWSA members that the Western Sydney Aerotropolis Plan, Development Control Plan and State Environment Planning Policy (SEPP) have been released and are now progressing through their public consultation period.	
		He compared Macquarie Park, which supports 85,000 jobs, to the expected 220,000 jobs to be created within the Aerotropolis.	
		He noted that the Western City Aerotropolis Authority is planning for the Aerotroplis to have A-grade office accommodation, with similar density to Penrith, Liverpool and Campbelltown. He spoke to members about the plans for public transport needing to be as well connected within Western Sydney as it is to the east.	

Mr Sangster then explained that industries are already looking to capitalise on the Airport, using the tourism industry as an example. The NSW Government is focused on competing with destinations such as Shanghai, rather than with Melbourne or Brisbane. As well as a strong educational focus, there is also a spotlight on space and aerospace industries, along with research/development and manufacturing.

Mr Sangster mentioned that the Western Sydney Airport sits within an overnight flight of 6.4 billion people in the Asia-Pacific area, with a large market looking to import from Australia. He noted that less than 2% of Australian exports to this area is sent from Sydney Airport. He noted investigations occurring into block chain tracking, which is already occurring in the meat and livestock exports.

Mr Sangster listed the partners who are interested in investing in the Western Parklands City, and noted that Hitachi has made a commercial commitment.

He spoke about planning for a 22nd century city and made comparisons to how Japan plans its cities in 100- and 200-year cycles, and how land use planning is ensuring that no development would affect the 24/7 operations of the airport.

Mr Sangster then spoke about the next steps in the Precinct Plan and Master Planning, which include the Mamre Road area (industrial land demand), the aerotropolis core, and agribusiness and storage land uses. He noted that plans for North Luddenham, Rosemore and Kemps Creek areas would be expected to done later.

The Chair thanked Mr Sangster for his presentation and asked members for questions.

Members discussed access to water in the area, with a focus on the Hawkesbury region. It was mentioned that new ways to approach water management need to be considered and that now was the time to start. Members noted that the media rarely mentions anything positive about recycled water opportunities.

		Mr Jacob Idiculus noted that Western Sydney should be a centre from which expertise can be exported and that connectivity is very important in making this happen. Cr Paul Rasmussen noted he would like to see jobs growth throughout the region, and not limited to the Aerotropolis. Mr Sangster replied jobs will be	
		created throughout the whole Western Parkland City.	
		Mr Bob Germaine said in 2016, Regional Development Australia conducted a survey with outcomes that may be relevant for the WCAA to consider.	
		Mr Sangster noted said that when he talked to manufacturers in Mascot they said they cannot afford expand in their current location. Brisbane Airport has recently had expansions that include such things as expansive ripening facilities which are attractive to exporters; however, there is simply no room for this in Mascot.	
		The Chair mentioned that the development of Western Sydney allows for incredible opportunities, but noted that care was needed when talking to overseas investors as confusion can be created between projects. He also reiterated a member's earlier comment, noting that it was important not to forget the areas of Western Sydney outside of the Western Sydney Aerotopolis Plan area.	
7.	Communications Update	Ms Sarah Leeming provided an update on the Department's communication and engagement activities. She noted that:	
		 there is 90% awareness of the Airport among the Western Sydney community; 	
		 following feedback from FOWSA and the community, the Department had undertaken evaluative research at the Local Government Authority (LGA) level 	
		 the Blue Mountains and Campbelltown LGAs displayed the lowest levels of favourability. For Campbelltown, members suggested this is because better transport links have not yet eventuated. 	

		 the Department will give a presentation on this research at the next FOWSA meeting. Ms Alison Morgan noted that work on the City Deal commitment for rapid buses to Campbelltown is being progressed. A number of members said that other surveys and research was being conducted, eg at the Council level, on community attitudes and it would be useful to discuss these at a future meeting. 	
8.	Other Business	Ms Leeming noted that she'd like to speak to members about the design of tools or graphics for flight paths (once developed) to the community to ensure that tools were created to answer any questions they may have. The Chair asked members to consider what type of information would be useful to answer community queries. The Chair asked members for any final questions on Dr Bullen's earlier presentation, and also members' views on how thel'm waiting on you technical presentation could be summarised to present to the community. Members discussed that it was important to clarify that operations at WSA could not be compared to KSA. Ms Leeming noted that Simone Concha, WSA's Sustainability Manager, has offered to speak to FOWSA about the WSA sustainability plan. Mr John Walton confirmed he had seen the correspondence responding to Mr John Harding's query about permissible development within the ANEC and that he believed the matter has been addressed.	Action Item 3: Secretariat to arrange Ms Concha to speak at future meeting
9.	Upcoming Meetings	Meeting 11 – Friday, 24th April 2020	

Status of Outstanding Action Items Meeting 1, 26 May 2017

Action Item Number	Action Item	Status
4	FOWSA Secretariat to distribute meeting papers to members	Ongoing
	electronically one week in advance of FOWSA.	

Meeting 7, 29 March 2019

Action Item Number	Action Item	Status
5	Secretariat to arrange a presentation to FOWSA in 2020 on the Future Food Systems Cooperative Research Centre.	Ongoing
6	Secretariat to consider future presentations to FOWSA in 2020 on the state of air and water quality in Western Sydney, and on the use of alternative fuels and technologies at WSA, including bioenergy.	Ongoing

Meeting 10, 6 December 2019

Action Item Number	Action Item	Status
1	Secretariat to arrange for next meeting to be held at WSA's Visitor Experience Centre	
2	Secretariat to send members a list of the engagement the Department has had with Dr Ancich/Mr Carter	
3	Secretariat to arrange for Ms Concha, Sustainability Manager WSA Co, to speak at a future meeting	

<u>Attendees</u>

Professor Peter Shergold AC (Chair) – Chancellor, Western Sydney University

Mr Wayne Wilmington – Resident of Luddenham

Mr Gregory Copeland – Resident of Camden

Mr John Walton - Resident of Silverdale

Ms Joanne Bromilow - Resident of Blaxland

Mr Jacob Idiculas – Resident of Bossley Park

Ms Kiersten Fishburn – CEO, Liverpool City Council

Cr Ross Fowler OAM - Mayor, Penrith City Council

Ms Lindy Deitz - General Manager, Campbelltown City Council

Mr Bob Germaine – Regional Development Australia Sydney

Mr Jim Davis - Regional Aviation Association of Australia

Ms Lee de Winton – CEO, Sydney Metro Airports Bankstown and Camden

Ms Alison Morgan - Director, Sydney Region, New South Wales Department of Premier and Cabinet

Mr Mustafa Agha – Sydney Business Chamber

Mr Will Spence - Office of Senator the Hon Marise Payne

Ex Officio Members

Nicole Ryan – Western Sydney Airport Scott MacKillop – Western Sydney Airport

Apologies

Senator the Hon Marise Payne – Senator for New South Wales

Ms Melissa McIntosh MP – Federal Member for Lindsay

Ms Anne Stanley MP – Federal Member for Werriwa

Dr Mike Freelander – Federal Member for Macarthur

Mr Gordon Henwood - Resident of Mulgoa

Mr Paul Chevalier - Virgin Australia

Ms Britt Walters - Qantas

Dr Rosemary Dillon - General Manager, Blue Mountains City Council

Mr David Borger - Western Sydney Director, Sydney Business Chamber